

FINAL

MARCH 2020

WASTEWATER TREATMENT RELOCATION STUDY

Dillingham, Alaska

prepared for:



prepared by:



3940 Arctic Boulevard, Ste 300
Anchorage, AK 99503

907.562.3252

&

Bristol



111 W. 16th Avenue, Third Floor
Anchorage, AK 99501

907.563.0013



TABLE OF CONTENTS

SECTION	PAGE
ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	vi
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
1.0 INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND.....	1
1.1 Purpose and Need for Project.....	1
1.2 Location	3
1.3 History	4
1.4 Climate.....	5
1.5 Topography and Geology	5
1.6 Demographics and Population Trends.....	6
1.7 Community Involvement and Key Stakeholder Outreach.....	6
1.7.1 Site Visit/Field Investigation	6
1.7.2 Coordination with Stakeholders	7
1.7.3 Presentation of Draft Study/Community Meeting.....	8
1.7.4 Presentation of Draft Final Study	8
2.0 EXISTING WASTEWATER SYSTEM OVERVIEW	9
2.1.1 Collection System.....	9
2.1.2 City of Dillingham Lagoon	11
2.1.3 Effluent Outfall	14
2.1.4 Planned Treatment Lagoon Improvements.....	16
2.1.5 Kananak Hospital Lagoon.....	16
3.0 REGULATORY CRITERIA.....	18
3.1 Minimum Construction Standards.....	18
3.2 Operator Certification Requirements	19
3.3 Wastewater Discharge	19
3.3.1 Surface/Subsurface Discharge.....	20
3.3.2 Surface Water Discharge (Fresh/Marine Water)	20
4.0 WASTEWATER TREATMENT ALTERNATIVES	24
4.1 Aerated Wastewater Treatment Lagoon.....	24

- 4.1.1 Defend Existing Lagoon in Place27
- 4.1.2 New Aerated Wastewater Treatment Lagoon.....29
- 4.2 Packaged Wastewater Treatment Plants.....31
 - 4.2.1 Membrane Bio-Reactor (MBR)32
 - 4.2.2 Moving Bed Bio-Film Reactor (MBBR).....36
- 4.3 Disinfection.....38
 - 4.3.1 Chlorination/Dechlorination38
 - 4.3.2 Ultraviolet Light.....39
- 5.0 SITE ALTERNATIVES41
 - 5.1 Site Design Criteria.....41
 - 5.1.1 FAA/ADOT&PF42
 - 5.2 Site 1 – Defend Existing Treatment Lagoon in Place42
 - 5.2.1 Property Ownership and Land Status (Dillingham Master Plan).....43
 - 5.2.2 Geotechnical Considerations.....44
 - 5.2.3 Erosion Protection Considerations45
 - 5.2.4 Environmental/Permitting Considerations48
 - 5.2.5 Utility/Infrastructure Considerations51
 - 5.3 Site 2 – City Shop Pad51
 - 5.3.1 Property Ownership and Land Status.....52
 - 5.3.2 Geotechnical Considerations.....52
 - 5.3.3 Environmental/Permitting Considerations54
 - 5.3.4 Utility/Infrastructure Considerations56
 - 5.4 Site 3 – Kananak Road57
 - 5.4.1 Property Ownership and Land Use57
 - 5.4.2 Geotechnical Considerations.....58
 - 5.4.3 Environmental/Permitting Considerations59
 - 5.4.4 Utility/Infrastructure Considerations61
- 6.0 COST ESTIMATES62
 - 6.1 Site 1/Alt. 1 – Defend In-Place with Sheetpile Revetment.....62
 - 6.2 Site 1/Alt. 2 – Defend In-Place with Armor Rock Revetment63
 - 6.3 Site 2/Alt. 1 – City Shop with Wastewater Lagoon63

6.4	Site 2/Alt. 2A – City Shop with MBR Packaged Treatment Plant	64
6.5	Site 2/Alt. 2B – City Shop with MBBR Packaged Treatment Plant	65
6.6	Site 3/Alt. 1 – Kanakanak Rd with Wastewater Lagoon.....	65
6.7	Site 3 /Alt. 2A – Kanakanak Rd with MBR Packaged Treatment Plant	66
6.8	Site 3/Alt. 2B– Kanakanak Rd with MBBR Packaged Treatment Plant	66
6.9	Cost Estimate Summary	67
7.0	ALTERNATIVES ANALYSIS AND CONCLUSIONS	68
7.1	Treatment Alternatives.....	68
7.1.1	Wastewater Treatment Lagoon (Alternative 1)	68
7.1.2	MBR Packaged Wastewater Treatment Plant (Alternative 2)	68
7.1.3	MBBR Packaged Wastewater Treatment Plant (Alternative 3).....	69
7.2	Site Alternatives.....	69
7.2.1	Site 1 – Defend Existing Treatment Lagoon in Place.....	69
7.2.2	Site 2 – City Shop Pad.....	70
7.2.3	Site 3 – Kanakanak Road	71
7.3	Alternatives Analysis Matrix.....	73
7.4	Conclusions	73
8.0	REFERENCES	75

TABLES

Table 1	City of Dillingham Population Estimate.....	6
Table 2	Effluent Exceedance Summary (April 2019 – March 2020)	12
Table 3	Dillingham Lagoon System and Wastewater Characteristics	14
Table 4	Kanakanak Hospital Lagoon System and Wastewater Characteristics.....	17
Table 5	Permit Authorization and General Permit Requirements	22
Table 6	Defend Existing Lagoon in Place Design Criteria	28
Table 7	New Aerated Wastewater Treatment Lagoon Design Criteria	30
Table 8	MBR Design Criteria	34
Table 9	MBBR Design Criteria.....	37
Table 10	Cost Estimate Summary.....	67
Table 11	Alternatives Analysis Matrix	73

EXHIBITS

- Exhibit 1 Dillingham Shoreline Erosion Analysis
- Exhibit 2 Dillingham Location Map
- Exhibit 3 Dillingham Water and Sewer Map
- Exhibit 4 Mixing Zones and Permit Limits
- Exhibit 5 Site Alternatives Location Map
- Exhibit 6 Sheetpile Wall Section
- Exhibit 7 Rock Revetment Section

PHOTOGRAPHS

- Photograph 1 – Pumper Truck Dumping at Existing Lagoon SE Corner Cell #1 (7/12/19)
- Photograph 2 – Effluent Line Protection North of Outfall (7/11/19)
- Photograph 3 – Site 1-Defend Existing Treatment Lagoon in Place (7/12/19)
- Photograph 4 – Site 2-City Shop Pad (7/12/19)
- Photograph 5 – Site 3-Kanakanak Hospital (7/11/19)

FIGURES

- Figure 1 – Existing Conditions Site Plan
- Figure 2 – Defend in Place Treatment Process
- Figure 3 – New Lagoon Treatment Process
- Figure 4 – MBR Treatment Process
- Figure 5 – MBBR Treatment Process
- Figure 6 – Site 1-Defend in Place Site Plan
- Figure 7 – Site 2-City Shop Pad Site Plan
- Figure 8 – Site 3-Kanakanak Road Site Plan

APPENDICES

Appendix A – Geotechnical Report

Appendix B – Archaeological Report

Appendix C – Community Involvement/Trip Reports

Appendix D – Treatment Process Design Information and Calculations

Appendix E – Cost Estimates

Appendix F – Land Status Information

Appendix G – Erosion Protection Information

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

'	minutes
°	degrees
°F	degrees Fahrenheit
AAC	Alaska Administrative Code
ADEC	Alaska Department of Environmental Conservation
ADF&G	Alaska Department of Fish and Game
APDES	Alaska Pollutant Discharge Elimination System
APE	Area of Potential Effects
BBHAC	Bristol Bay Health Corporation
BOD ₅	Five-day Biological Oxygen Demand
Bristol	Bristol Engineering Services Company, LLC
City	City of Dillingham
CRW	CRW Engineering Group, LLC
DCCED	State of Alaska Department of Commerce, Community and Economic Development
DI	ductile iron
DO	dissolved oxygen
EPA	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
FC	Fecal Coliform
Golder	Golder Associates, Inc.
HDD	horizontal directional drilling
HMS	HMS, Inc.
IPaC	Information for Planning and Consultation
MBBR	moving bed bio-film reactor
MBR	membrane bio-reactor
NEPA	National Environmental Policy Act
NOAA	National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
NRCS	Natural Resources Conservation Service
pH	potential hydrogen
POTW	public owned treatment works
SOI	Secretary of Interior
Study	Wastewater Treatment Relocation Study
TRC	total residual chlorine

True North	True North Sustainable Development Solutions
TSS	total suspended solids
USACE	US Army Corps of Engineers
UV	ultraviolet
WHMP	Wildlife Hazard Management Plan

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The City of Dillingham operates a wastewater treatment system that serves the core community area. The treatment system consists of a two-cell, partially aerated wastewater lagoon located on the north east side of Dillingham, adjacent to the bluff at the confluence of the Nushagak and Wood Rivers, and Nushagak Bay.

The Nushagak estuary shoreline is highly erosive, with an average erosion rate of 11-12 feet per year and continued erosion along the Nushagak River places the lagoon system, effluent outfall, and associated site infrastructure at risk of failure.

A failure of the lagoon system could have serious, long-term consequences, putting the community's health at risk from untreated sewage, as well as the salmon fisheries that the Bristol Bay region relies on for subsistence and economic survivability.

This Study evaluated three treatment types (lagoon, MBR, and MBBR) and three potential sites within Dillingham (existing/defend in-place, City Shop, and Kanakanak Road) for a total of total of eight alternatives to meet the City's long-term wastewater treatment objectives:

- Site 1/Alt. 1 – Defend In-Place with Sheetpile Wall Revetment
- Site 1/Alt. 2 – Defend In-Place with Armor Rock Revetment
- Site 2/Alt. 1 – City Shop with New Wastewater Lagoon
- Site 2/Alt. 2A – City Shop with New MBR Packaged Treatment Plant
- Site 2/Alt. 2B – City Shop with New MBBR Packaged Treatment Plant
- Site 3/Alt. 1 – Kanakanak Road with New Wastewater Lagoon
- Site 3/Alt. 2A – Kanakanak Road with New MBR Packaged Treatment Plant
- Site 3/Alt. 2B – Kanakanak Road with New MBBR Packaged Treatment Plant

The following table summarizes life-cycle costs for each site and treatment alternative combination as presented in Section 6.

Cost Estimate Summary

DESCRIPTION	CAPITAL COST	SALVAGE VALUE	O&M COSTS		SHORT LIVED ASSETS		TOTAL LIFE-CYCLE COST
			ANNUAL	PRESENT WORTH	ANNUAL	PRESENT WORTH	
Site 1/Alt. 1	\$ 27,902,017	\$ 20,000	\$ 475,000	\$ 9,007,132	\$ 4,225	\$ 80,116	\$ 36,969,265
Site 1/Alt. 2	\$ 33,440,552	\$ 20,000	\$ 495,000	\$ 9,386,379	\$ 4,225	\$ 80,116	\$ 42,887,047
Site 2/Alt. 1	\$ 52,342,263	\$ 80,000	\$ 375,000	\$ 7,110,893	\$ 4,225	\$ 80,116	\$ 59,453,273
Site 2/Alt. 2A	\$ 19,860,418	\$ 250,000	\$ 866,900	\$ 16,438,490	\$ 20,000	\$ 379,248	\$ 36,428,155
Site 2/Alt. 2B	\$ 24,548,648	\$ 200,000	\$ 600,575	\$ 11,388,333	\$ 4,800	\$ 91,019	\$ 35,828,000
Site 3/Alt. 1	\$ 29,583,440	\$ 80,000	\$ 399,000	\$ 7,565,991	\$ 4,225	\$ 80,116	\$ 37,149,547
Site 3/Alt. 2A	\$ 25,414,528	\$ 250,000	\$ 890,900	\$ 16,893,587	\$ 20,000	\$ 379,248	\$ 42,437,362
Site 3/Alt. 2B	\$ 29,868,847	\$ 200,000	\$ 624,575	\$ 11,843,430	\$ 4,800	\$ 91,019	\$ 41,603,297

The following Alternatives Analysis Matrix summarizes and qualifies the considerations discussed in Sections 4, 5, and 6. Each of the treatment and site alternative combinations were evaluated against a set of analysis criteria and ranked on a scale of 1 to 5, with 5 being the most favorable alternative. In addition, the matrix includes weight factors for each of the analysis criteria which are based on Bristol and CRW experience in Dillingham and engineering judgement.

Alternatives Analysis Matrix

ALTERNATIVE	LIFE-CYCLE COSTS	OPERATIONAL COMPLEXITY	EXISTING INFRASTRUCTURE	CULTURAL RESOURCES	CONSTRUCT ABILITY	LAND USE	COMMUNITY PREFERENCE	SCORE
WEIGHT FACTOR	0.30	0.20	0.10	0.05	0.10	0.10	0.15	1.00
Site 1/Alt. 1	4 1.20	5 1.00	5 0.50	3 0.15	5 0.50	5 0.50	5 0.75	4.60
Site 1/Alt. 2	2 0.60	5 1.00	5 0.50	3 0.15	5 0.50	5 0.50	4 0.60	3.85
Site 2/Alt. 1	1 0.30	4 0.80	2 0.20	5 0.25	1 0.10	4 0.40	2 0.30	2.35
Site 2/Alt. 2A	5 1.50	1 0.20	2 0.20	5 0.25	3 0.30	4 0.40	1 0.15	3.00
Site 2/Alt. 2B	5 1.50	2 0.40	2 0.20	5 0.25	3 0.30	4 0.40	3 0.45	3.50
Site 3/Alt. 1	5 1.50	4 0.80	1 0.10	2 0.10	3 0.30	3 0.30	3 0.45	3.55
Site 3/Alt. 2A	3 0.90	1 0.20	1 0.10	2 0.10	3 0.30	3 0.30	1 0.15	2.05
Site 3/Alt. 2B	3 0.90	2 0.40	1 0.10	2 0.10	3 0.30	3 0.30	2 0.30	2.40